

SJPL Graphic Novel Making Contest

Judging Criteria Guide

When judging graphic novel entries, consider the following criteria and rate submissions based on the degree to which they're met for their age group:

Illustration:

- Workmanship
 - Is it clean and professional, or are there smudges, sloppy lines, etc.
 - Are the illustrations clear? Is it easy to tell what's going on, who is who?
 - Is the story visually easy to follow?
 - Is the quality of work consistent throughout the comic?
- Technique
 - What level of skill and/or effort is evident for their age group?
 - Are characters and objects drawn accurately for their age and skills?
 - Are they successfully using their chosen media?
 - Is there visual depth (overlapping, line weight, sense of space). If applicable, is perspective being portrayed correctly?
 - If applicable, is there an understanding of light and shadow?
- Page Layout
 - Does the overall page and panel layout flow?
 - Are the transitions easy to follow?
 - How are the compositions and framing within the panels?
 - Does the shape, size, and placement of panels tell you anything more about the emotion or importance of their scenes, or are they generic?
- Creativity
 - Is the style unique and distinctive or have you seen it a lot?
 - Are there interesting character designs?
 - Does the background design serve as an interesting setting?
- Expressiveness
 - How much emotion/reaction can be read from the character's facial expressions and body language? Can you tell without reading the text?
 - Do the illustrations overall (characters, style, setting) evoke a certain mood? Does it match the story?

Story & Text:

- Originality
 - Have you seen this story before?
 - If so, did they take a new or interesting view of it?
 - Is it predictable? If there's a twist, is it thoughtful or an easy out?
 - Does the story resonate or leave any impact on you?
- Clarity & Plot
 - Is the story easy to follow? If not, does it feel like it's that way on purpose?
 - How is the pacing?
 - Does the plot make sense? Is there some form of resolution?
 - How well does the text move the story forward?
- Setting & Characters
 - Is the setting well established?
 - How do the characters work in the setting?
 - Do the characters feel genuine instead of cliché? Are they unique from each other?
 - Do the characters grow?
- Grammar & Dialogue
 - Is the grammar and spelling correct? If not, does it help or detract from the story?
 - Is the dialogue appropriate for the age group?
 - Is the dialogue authentic? Does it match the emotion presented in the images or author's intent?
- Use of Text
 - Is the text legible?
 - Is the text well-placed within the art?
 - Is there a balance between the text and art that serves the story well?
 - Do text variations (font styles, bold/italic/underline, sound effects, etc.) make sense and help the story, or is it out of place?

Judging Scorecard

Based on the detailed rubric, write the number that best represents the comic's fulfillment in that criteria on a scale of 1-5 with 5 being the highest.

Illustration		Story & Text	
Workmanship	/ 5	Originality	/ 5
Technique	/ 5	Clarity & Plot	/ 5
Page Layout	/ 5	Setting & Characters	/ 5
Creativity	/ 5	Grammar & Dialogue	/ 5
Expressiveness	/ 5	Use of Text	/ 5
Total	/ 25	Total	/ 25

Total Score _____ / 50